

Combating Poverty and Inequality

Structural Change, Social Policy and Politics



UNITED NATIONS RESEARCH INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

Combating Poverty and Inequality

Structural Change, Social Policy and Politics

UNITED NATIONS RESEARCH INSTITUTE FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

Copyright © 2010 United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD) Palais des Nations, 1211 Geneva 10, Switzerland

Short extracts from this publication may be reproduced unaltered without authorization on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to UNRISD, which welcomes such applications.

The designations employed in this publication and the presentation of material herein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNRISD concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

UNRISD publication Sales No. E.10.III.Y.1 ISBN 978-92-9085-076-2 Printed in France GE.10-01438–August 2010–2,000 UNRISD/2010/4

For a list of any errors or omissions found subsequent to printing, please visit our website at www.unrisd.org.

Foreword

Human progress in recent decades has been very uneven. Alongside remarkable advances in life expectancy, literacy and overall human well-being, there remain serious concerns and deprivation – persistent poverty, heightened inequalities and greater vulnerability of many communities and social groups in much of the world.

The United Nations summits of the 1990s, in particular the 1995 World Summit for Social Development, emphasized the need to balance the economic and social objectives of development. The Social Summit called for policy and institutional changes to promote inclusive development and, in the Copenhagen Declaration, Governments committed "to creating an economic, political, social, cultural and legal environment that will enable people to achieve social development".

The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) also expressed, in concrete terms, this renewed commitment to social development. And indeed, the goals have been a highly effective tool to mobilize Governments and other development actors, including the scientific and research community.

Combating Poverty and Inequality is an important contribution to efforts to systematically explain how poverty reduction depends crucially on the interconnections among economic development, social policy and politics. The report reveals how poverty and inequality cannot be addressed by narrow approaches to social protection, or faith in the by-now-discredited notion that the benefits of economic growth will sufficiently trickle down to the poor. The analysis points instead to the need for new directions in macroeconomic policy and structural change to generate decent employment. It also stresses that processes of policy and institutional change should be democratically anchored and shaped by active citizenship. UNRISD is well placed to have undertaken such a comprehensive inquiry. It has drawn on both its extensive network of researchers from around the world and its autonomous status within the United Nations system. This status allows the Institute wide latitude to engage with sensitive issues, question mainstream policies and institutional arrangements, and propose alternatives. Studies of this nature, which can generate new policy options grounded in sound empirical evidence, are essential if we are to accelerate progress towards poverty reduction. On the eve of the 2010 review of the MDGs, I commend the findings to policy makers and a wide global audience.

Ki Mow Ban

/ Ban Ki-moon United Nations Secretary-General New York, July 2010

Preface

Combating Poverty and Inequality is published just as global leaders meet to review and recommit themselves to a set of goals for reducing poverty agreed, under vastly different circumstances, a decade ago. The optimism of the new millennium is now overshadowed by the effects of multiple, interrelated crises. Progress in many areas appears threatened and resources are more constrained.

This volume provides a timely reminder of the strengths and limitations of various approaches to addressing poverty in the current context. It is the culmination of an ambitious project, Poverty Reduction and Policy Regimes, initiated with characteristic foresight by my predecessor as Director of UNRISD, Thandika Mkandawire. Responding to a concern that dominant approaches to poverty reduction, as reflected for example in the PRSPs and MDGs, had serious shortcomings, the research aimed to reposition the analysis of poverty and poverty reduction processes within the broader political economy of development. A key premise of the report is that poverty cannot be reduced when both analysis of the problem, and the people affected, are relegated to the margins of development processes - targeted with safety nets or residual policy interventions while economic growth fails to create jobs, deliver services, or provide other means through which all individuals can realize their capabilities.

Building on lessons from prior research on social policy by UNRISD, the report demonstrates that countries which have successfully reduced poverty, from Europe to East Asia, did so through strategic state interventions. These included transformative social policies that aimed not only at protecting the vulnerable, but that also enhanced productive capacities, provided critical social investments and performed a redistributive function that contributed, in turn, to social cohesion and nation building. Critical to this process have been links forged between state capacity, institutional arrangements and policies across the spheres of politics, the economy and society. As we face an increasingly complex global environment, where progress in some areas is threatened by new sources of vulnerability in others, solutions will equally need to reflect this complexity. The interrelationships between institutions of the state, market and household, and between social and economic policies, as well as relationships of politics and power, must inform our policy responses. We hope that this volume illuminates some of the critical linkages as we continue to seek effective interventions for combating poverty.

On behalf of UNRISD, I would like to thank the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) and the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs for their generous and patient support for the research on which this report is based, as well as the governments of Denmark, Finland, Mexico, Norway, South Africa, Sweden, Switzerland and the United Kingdom who have provided core funding to UNRISD during the course of this work and without which such endeavours would not be possible. Many researchers around the world contributed to this report: we are grateful to them all. Yusuf Bangura, who has worked tirelessly as project coordinator and lead author to see this project through to completion, deserves particular recognition. I would also like to express my personal gratitude and congratulations to all my colleagues at UNRISD: this has been an Institute-wide effort, and a very long journey which I joined only in its final steps. We hope the results will contribute to renewed commitments and improved policies to reverse widening inequalities and end the unacceptable deprivation which continues to afflict millions of people worldwide.

Sarah Cool

Sarah Cook, Director of UNRISD, Geneva, July 2010

Acknowledgements

This report is the product of collective work by UNRISD staff and its large network of collaborating researchers. The report greatly benefited from numerous conversations around conceptual, methodological, thematic and case study issues as well as draft chapters. Special thanks are due to the more than 100 individuals who provided background papers and reviewed various chapters of the report. UNRISD gratefully acknowledges Thandika Mkandawire, Director from 1998 to 2009, for his key role in initiating the project, preparing the project proposal and seeking funding for it, as well as for his insightful comments on early drafts of the report completed prior to his retirement from the Institute in April 2009. Peter Utting provided guidance as Officer-in-Charge of the Institute from May to October 2009. Sarah Cook, UNRISD's current Director, made valuable substantive contributions and editorial suggestions on the final draft. UNRISD is also grateful to its Board for insightful discussions of drafts of the report on several occasions.

The Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) and the Finnish Ministry of Foreign Affairs provided funding for the research project, *Poverty Reduction and Policy Regimes*, of which this report is the culmination. As with all UNRISD activities, work on this report would not have been possible without core funding. The Institute is grateful to the governments of Denmark, Finland, Mexico, Norway, South Africa, Sweden, Switzerland and the United Kingdom for their contributions during the course of this work.

Team for the Preparation of the Report

Research and writing

Yusuf Bangura, Coordinator and lead author.

Rebecca Varghese Buchholz, Elena Gaia, Katja Hujo, Nicola Hypher, Thomas Lavers, José Carlos Marques, Shea McClanahan, Shahra Razavi, Pon Souvannaseng, Silke Staab, Peter Utting and Ilcheong Yi. Mary Kinyanjui, Enrique Peruzzotti and Imraan Valodia provided useful comments as Visiting Research Fellows at UNRISD. Carl-Johan Hedberg provided research assistance at the conceptual stage of the project. The following interns also offered valuable support: Temilade Aromolaran, Saidakhror Burkhanov, Christy Campbell, Maria Garrone, Mathew Geddes, Helen Harris, Maegan Hendow, Mary Karauri, Leonardo Lara, Christy McConnell, Aditi Nigam, Cecilie Wathne and Nicola Wermer.

Thomas Lavers and Pon Souvannaseng acted as focal points at different stages of the project.

Editing, production and support

Jenifer Freedman coordinated the editorial and production side. UNRISD is grateful to Lois Jensen, who edited the report and provided valuable editorial advice. The report benefited from the dedicated work of Suroor Alikhan and Anita Tombez, who copyedited it and provided general publication assistance. Ilcheong Yi helped prepare some of the figures at the production stage. The report was designed and typeset by Latitudesign, and printed by Imprimerie Courand et Associés – ICA. Sylvie Liu, Véronique Martinez, Richard Warren and interns in the UNRISD Publication and Dissemination Unit gave advice and assistance with the distribution and promotion of the report. Thanks are also due to Josephine Grin-Yates, Alexander Dénis and Wendy Salvo for administrative support.

Contributors

Case studies, overview papers and thematic papers on a wide range of issues relating to the report were contributed by Rosemary Atieno, Armando Barrientos, Anthony Bebbington, Cristina Bloj, Michael Blowfield, Robert Boyer, Graham Brown, Michelle J. Budig, Debbie Budlender,

C.P. Chandrasekhar, Yu-fang Chang, Jung-Rong Chen, Ling Ping Chen, Vivek Chibber, Alberto Cortés, Colin Crouch, Jorge Vargas Cullell, Norberto Dachs, Jonathan Di John, Do Duc Dinh, Sônia Miriam Draibe, Abdul Rahman Embong, Nancy Folbre, Juliana Martínez Franzoni, James Galbraith, Jayati Ghosh, Olivier Giovannoni, Terence Gomez, Janet C. Gornick, Ricardo Gottschalk, Ian Gough, James Heintz, Wilnês Henrique, Sara Hsu, Chung-Hsien Huang, Chua Beng Huat, Nicola Hypher, Institute of Policy Studies of Sri Lanka, Mohamud A. Jama, Markus Jäntti, Khoo Khay Jin, Mushtaq H. Khan, Jaakko Kiander, Peadar Kirby, Atul Kohli, Yeun-wen Ku, Parashar Kulkarni, Hyunsub Kum, Huck-ju Kwon, Arnim Langer, Thomas Lavers, Eddie Lee, Adrian Leftwich, Andrés León, Jen-Der Lue, Gervase S. Maipose, Alastair McAuley, Philip McMichael, Marcus André Melo, Joya Misra, Winnie Mitullah, Imogen Patience Bonolo Mogotsi, Saidatulakmal Mohd, Nadia Molenaers, Ann Morissens, Rayaprolu Nagaraj, Paresh Kumar Narayan, Nicoli Nattrass, Andrew Nickson, Keitseope Nthomang, Dolly Ntseane, Jean C. Oi, Adams Oloo, Joseph Onjala, Marcio Pochmann, D. Rajasekhar, Halim Salleh, Brasilio Sallum Jr., Diego Sánchez-Ancochea, Jeremy Seekings, Onalenna Doo Selolwane, Gita Sen, Mihir Shah, P.S. Vijay Shankar, Miriam Abu Sharkh, Adam Sheingate, Pedro Luiz Barros Silva, Happy Siphambe, Rachel Slater, Guy Standing, John Stephens, M.H. Suryanarayana, Khoo Boo Teik, Juan Diego Trejos, Rob van Tulder, Isabel Román Vega, Juan Manuel Villasuso, Francis Loh Kok Wah, Nicola Wermer, Ilcheong Yi and Jayoung Yoon.

The report draws substantially on data generated by the following organizations: ActionAid International, Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations, International Labour Office, International Monetary Fund, Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, Transparency International, United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, United Nations Development Programme, United Nations Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization Institute for Statistics, United Nations Industrial Development Organization, United Nations Millennium Project, World Bank, and World Health Organization.

Reviewers

The report benefited from very useful comments received from Björn Beckman, Valeria Esquivel, Charles Gore, Vedi Hadiz, Anthony Hall, Naila Kabeer, Rubén M. Lo Vuolo, Frances Lund, Rianne Mahon, Carmelo Mesa-Lago, Kwame A. Ninsin, Ashwani Saith, Richard Sandbrook, Ben Ross Schneider, Stephanie Seguino, Ajit Singh, Ole Therkildsen, Wouter van Ginneken and John Weeks. UNRISD gratefully acknowledges the critical and useful comments provided by participants in the workshop on 5–6 November 2008 in Geneva at which a draft of the report was reviewed.

Preparation of the chapters

- Chapter 1 is based substantially on Heintz (2009), with inputs from Ghosh (2008), Bangura (2008) and McMichael (2009). The chapter was prepared by Yusuf Bangura.
- Chapter 2 draws substantially on Galbraith (2008), with inputs from Lee (2009) and Ghosh (2008). The chapter was prepared by Yusuf Bangura.
- Chapter 3 is based on Brown and Langer (2009, 2008), with inputs from Gomez (2009) and Bangura (2006). The chapter was prepared Yusuf Bangura.
- Chapter 4 was prepared by Shahra Razavi and Silke Staab, with substantial input from Heintz (2008).
- Chapter 5 was prepared by Katja Hujo and Elena Gaia, with input from Shea McClanahan.
- Chapter 6 was prepared by Nicola Hypher and Ilcheong Yi.
- Chapter 7 was prepared by Shahra Razavi and Silke Staab.
- Chapter 8 was prepared by Katja Hujo and Elena Gaia, with input from Shea McClanahan.
- Chapter 9 was prepared by Peter Utting, Rebecca Varghese Buchholz and José Carlos Marques.
- Chapter 10 was prepared by Yusuf Bangura, with input from Thomas Lavers.
- Chapter 11 was prepared by Yusuf Bangura, with input from Thomas Lavers.

Contents



Foreword	III
Preface	V
Acknowledgements	VII

SECTION ONE: SOCIALLY INCLUSIVE STRUCTURAL CHANGE

CI	HAPTER 1: Towards Employment-Centred Structural Change.	29
1.	Structural Change in a Globalized World	31
	The traditional pattern of structural change may not apply in a globalized world	32
2.	Emerging Trends in Employment	34
	Household incomes are affected by the dynamics of global labour supply	34
3.	How Different Patterns of Development Affect Employment	36
	East Asian states have followed the classic manufacturing growth path	36
	The dualism of many middle-income countries exacerbates inequalities	40
	Can service-led development be an alternative to industrialization?	43
	Low-income countries remain heavily agrarian.	45
	Without careful management, mineral wealth can be a mixed blessing	50
4.	The Links between Employment and Poverty	52
	The working poor poverty rate is one indication of how employment affects poverty	52
5.	Putting Employment Back on the Agenda: Implications for Policy	54
	Improve employment opportunities	54
	Transform the structure of employment to make sustained inroads against poverty	56
CI	HAPTER 2: Income Inequality and Structural Change	59

Income Equality and Poverty Reduction	61
High levels of inequality inhibit development	61
Global Trends in Inequality	62
The global income gap remains daunting	62
Income inequality has increased in the majority of countries around the world	63
The gap is growing between wage earners and those who derive their income from profits	65
	High levels of inequality inhibit development Global Trends in Inequality The global income gap remains daunting Income inequality has increased in the majority of countries around the world

3.	Inequality, Structural Change and Global Intersectoral Terms of Trade	66
	Early development thinking held that inequality rose in the early stages of development, and then declined	68
	Global intersectoral terms of trade are a key determinant of inequality	68
	Most low-income agrarian economies are highly unequal	70
	Global forces now shape the movement of inequality within countries	71
	How structural change and global forces affect inequality: Country examples	72
4.	Redistributing Wealth and Income: Implications for Policy	76
	Make deliberate policy choices to ensure that growth and equity reinforce one another	76
	Strengthen the role of the state in fiscal redistribution	77
	Refocus on land reform	78
	Look after the best interests of small farmers	78
	Advocate for reforms in the governance of the global economy	79

CHAPTER 3: Tackling Ethnic and Regional	l Inequalities	81
---	----------------	----

1.	Ethnic and Spatial Inequalities and Development	82
	Many factors contribute to spatial inequalities	82
	Regional inequalities typically increase in early stages of development, and later even out	83
	Ethnic inequalities are often rooted in historical circumstances	84
2.	Ethnic and Spatial Inequalities and Structural Change	86
	How inequalities have evolved in agrarian and industrializing economies	86
3.	Addressing Ethnic and Regional Inequalities: Implications for Policy	102
	Affirmative action is best pursued as part of a larger framework	103
	Universal programmes may not be enough	104
	Political and cultural inclusivity is key to action for disadvantaged groups	105

1.	Women's Work and Income in Advanced Industrialized Economies	109
	Women's participation in the labour market is growing, but gender gaps in wages and work conditions persist	109
	State transfers help narrow the poverty gap between men and women	109
	Pooling income within households can ease women's poverty but create dependency	110
2.	Poverty, Work and Gender in a Development Context	111
	Women are disproportionately affected by the rise in informal employment.	111
	The informal economy is stratified by gender and other social identities	112
	Social norms and power relations affect women's access to paid work and control over earnings	113
	Gender inequality in labour markets is persistent across diverse development paths	113
3.	Gender, Poverty and the Role of Household Structures	120
	Income pooling is not sufficient to close gender-based poverty gaps in the Republic of Korea	120
	Income pooling effects in Brazil and South Africa vary according to household structures	120
	In India, women's employment is often induced by distress, in contrast to Kenya	124

4.	The Role of the State in Addressing Gender Inequality and Poverty: Implications for Policy	124
	Protect informal workers through state regulation	125
	Promote social protection, but not as a substitute for decent employment	126
	Increase women's access to land, microcredit and other productive assets	128
	Institute policies that support women's long-term economic security	128

SECTION TWO: TRANSFORMATIVE SOCIAL POLICY AND POVERTY REDUCTION

CI	HAPTER 5: Towards Universal Social Protection	135
1.	The Case for Universal Social Protection	136
	Neoliberal approaches to social protection fail to deliver on several counts	137
	The benefits of narrowly targeting social assistance are questionable	138
	Universal social protection demands a strong state role	139
	Universal programmes offer greater benefits	139
	Universal social protection can enhance economic progress	141
	Universal social protection reduces poverty and inequality	142
2.	Changing Patterns of Social Protection	144
	Various routes to universal social protection exist	145
3.	Instituting Universal Social Protection: Implications for Policy	156
	Where poverty is widespread, social protection programmes should promote sustainable livelihoods	
	and redistribution	156
	A rights-based approach to social protection should seek to limit conditionality and targeting	157
	Social assistance should be complemented by policies that promote redistribution and decent work	157

Cŀ	HAPTER 6: Universal Provision of Social Services.	161
1.	The Case for Universal and Public Provision	162
	Universal access to social services promotes growth and social development	162
	The state plays a critical role in social provision	163
	Recent policy trends have weakened universalist principles	164
2.	Social Services in Developing Countries: Trends and Outcomes	165
	Social service policies have shifted dramatically over the last half century	165
	Neoliberal shifts since the 1980s have produced a trend towards commercialization	167
	Underfunding and commercialization can have negative consequences for health and education	169
3.	Social Service Provision in Different Development Contexts	172
	Countries vary widely in their systems of social service provision	172
4.	Providing Universal Social Services: Implications for Policy	180
	Publicly financed systems can be affordable	180
	Effective commercialization requires regulation	181

Cl	HAPTER 7: Care and Well-Being in a Development Context	185
1.	Care in Context: Institutional Arrangements and Enabling Policies	186
	Diverse institutions have a hand in caregiving	186
	An enabling environment can ease the burden of care	187
	Specific care policies can also lighten the load	187
	Economic development can squeeze women's caregiving time	188
2.	Unpaid Care in Households, Families and Communities	188
	Women's time spent on unpaid care is higher than men's everywhere	188
	Women spend more time on paid and unpaid care combined than men	189
	Several factors affect the amount of unpaid care work performed by both sexes	189
3.	Care Arrangements across Countries	191
	How care policies affect outcomes	191
4.	Putting Care on the Agenda: Implications for Policy	202
	Invest in infrastructure and basic social services	203
	Ensure an adequate and reliable source of income	203
	Create synergies between social transfers and social services	203
	Build on existing programmes to cover care needs	203
	Recognize care workers and guarantee their rights	203
	Make care work more visible	204

CI	CHAPTER 8: Financing Social Policy	
1.	Spending on Social Policy	208
	Social spending reflects both national incomes and policy choices	208
	The global context influences the financing of social policy	209
2.	Revenue Sources and Their Impact on Development	211
	Different financing instruments affect redistribution and reproduction in different ways.	211
	Different financing instruments affect production and protection in different ways	213
3.	Mobilizing Resources for Social Policy	214
	Designing equitable and efficient tax systems is key to development	214
	Extension of social insurance schemes is a challenge for developing countries	218
	A wealth of mineral resources does not necessarily enrich people	220
	Aid can contribute to social development and international justice	223
	Remittances are a financing source for development and household welfare	226
4.	Financing Social Development: Implications for Policy	227
	Create financing mechanisms that are sustainable, equitable and conducive to economic development	227
	Consider the political and macroeconomic effects of various types of financing	228
	Anchor a country's social policy system with domestic sources of financing	228

SECTION THREE: THE POLITICS OF POVERTY REDUCTION

CHAPTER 9: Business, Power and Poverty Reduction.		233
1.	The Rhetoric and Reality of Corporate Responsibility	234
	The social agenda of business is expanding	234
	Assessments of CSR reveal major shortcomings	236
	CSR varies by region, industry and firm	238
	Attention should refocus on corporate accountability	240
2.	Changes and Variations in State-Business Relations	241
	Globalization and liberalization have profoundly altered power relations	241
	The influence of business varies by industry and policy regime	242
3.	How Social Pressure Can Affect Corporate Behaviour.	244
	Labour movements are showing signs of revival	245
	Activism is becoming more cohesive	246
	The nature of social activism varies by policy regime	246
4.	Business Preferences Relating to Social and Labour Market Policy	247
	Business preferences have changed under globalization	247
5.	The Potential and Limits of Collaborative Institutions	250
	Social dialogue and bargaining help drive corporate change	250
	Broad-based business associations can be forces for inclusive development	251
6.	Towards Corporate Accountability: Implications for Policy	252
	Create an enabling environment for collective action	253
	Forge social pacts between business and government	254
	Promote international norms and laws that regulate TNCs.	254
	Bring states back into the development equation.	254

1.	Dimensions of State Capacity That Promote Development	259
	Political capacity is fundamental to setting and implementing policy.	259
	The capacity to mobilize resources is key to achieving development goals	263
	The capacity to put resources to effective use is the core of state power	268
2.	Market-Enhancing Institutional Reforms	273
	The link between good governance and growth is weak	273
	Market-enhancing managerial reforms were part of a second wave of reforms	275
	Progress in decentralization is uneven	278

Building State Capacity for Structural Change and Poverty Reduction: Implications for Policy	280
Forge political settlements for redistribution	280
Improve domestic resource mobilization and encourage citizen involvement in the allocation	
and monitoring of resources	281
Tackle the three dimensions of state capacity directly rather than rely on good governance reforms	
to improve delivery of services	281
Create the foundations of a Weberian bureaucracy to improve service delivery for the poor	281
Improve the quality of decentralization by involving low-income groups in local decision-making processes	281
	Forge political settlements for redistribution

CHAPTER 11: Democracy and the Politics of Poverty Reduction 283

1.	Democracy and Redistribution	285
	Democracy tends to produce redistributive outcomes, but is subject to group influences	285
2.	External Constraints to Pursuing Redistributive Policies	287
	Government capture by technocrats insulates decisions from the will of the people	287
	Aid conditionality limits the policy options of governments.	290
3.	Domestic Constraints to Pursuing Redistributive Policies	292
4.	When Democracies Deliver Outcomes That Are Beneficial to the Poor	295
	In high-income democracies, organized interest groups spurred redistribution	295
	In welfare democracies in the South, subaltern groups were the main catalysts for change	297
	In dualist countries leaning towards welfare democracy, social pacts have been key	299
	Gains are possible, even if interest groups lack ties to power	301
	In countries with weak civil societies, electoral competition can bring leaders to account	303
5.	The Politics of Poverty Reduction: Implications for Policy	305
	Abandon technocratic styles of policy making	305
	Go beyond NGO–centred PRSP forums and more actively engage associations and social movements	306
	Institutionalize rights to encourage effective group participation in policy making	306
	Support organizations that represent the views of diverse groups that include the participation of formal	
	and informal workers	306
	Recognize the fact that not all groups can be incorporated into bargaining regimes	306
	Empower the general population to exercise influence on how polices are made	306

CONCLUDING REMARKS: Coordinating Social, Economic and Political Forces to Deliver for the Poor	309
Background Papers	313
References	317
Acronyms	355
List of Boxes, Figures and Tables	357